INCESTUOUS RAPE UNDER THE LAWS OF BRUNEI DARUSSALAM AND THE SHARIAH

NOR AZUANA BINTI ASMALEE 17MR603

FACULTY OF SHARIAH AND LAW UNIVERSITI ISLAM SULTAN SHARIF ALI BRUNEI DARUSSALAM

1441H / 2020M

بسم الله الرحمن الرحيم

INCESTUOUS RAPE UNDER THE LAWS OF BRUNEI DARUSSALAM AND THE SHARIAH

NOR AZUANA BINTI ASMALEE 17MR603

A THESIS SUBMITTED IN FULFILMENT OF THE REQUIREMENTS FOR THE AWARD OF THE DEGREE OF MASTER OF LAW

Faculty of Shariah and Law Universiti Islam Sultan Sharif Ali Negara Brunei Darussalam

Syaban 1441 / April 2020

SUPERVISION

INCESTUOUS RAPE UNDER THE LAWS OF BRUNEI DARUSSALAM AND THE SHARIAH

NOR AZUANA BINTI ASMALEE 17MR603

Supervisor	: Dr Widad binti Abd Aziz		
Signature	:	Date :	
Faculty Dear	ı : Dr Hajah Masnooraini binti Ha	ji Mohiddin	
Signature	:	Date :	

DECLARATION

I hereby declare that the work in this academic exercise is my own except for quotations and summaries which have been duly acknowledged.

Signature :

Name : Nor Azuana binti Asmalee

Registration Number : 17MR603

Date of Submission :

DECLARATION OF COPYRIGHT AND AFFIRMATION OF FAIR USE OF UNPUBLISHED RESEARCH

Copyright © 2020 by Nor Azuana binti Asmalee. All rights reserved.

INCESTUOUS RAPE UNDER THE LAWS OF BRUNEI DARUSSALAM AND THE SHARIAH

No part of this unpublished research may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise without prior written permission of the copyright holder except as provided below:

- 1. Any material contained in or derived from this unpublished research may only be used by others in their writing with due acknowledgement.
- 2. UNISSA or its library will have the right to make and transmit copies (print and electronic) for institutional and academic purposes.
- 3. The UNISSA library will have the right to make, store in retrieval system and supply copies of this unpublished research if requested by other universities and research libraries.

Affirmed by Nor Azuana binti Asmalee.	
	Syaban 1441 / April 2020
Signature:	Date:

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

صلى الله) and His Messenger Muhammad (سبحانه وتعالى) and His Messenger Muhammad for having made it possible to complete this research paper- I express sincere (عليه وسلم gratitude to the Government of His Majesty the Sultan and Yang Di-Pertuan of Brunei Darussalam, who granted me a scholarship to pursue a degree of Master of Law at Sultan Sharif Ali Islamic University. I wish to express my sincere appreciation to my supervisor, Dr Ahmad Masum for his continued support and guidance during the writing of this research paper. I also take this opportunity to thank Ustazah Nooraida binti Haji Timpus and ASP Sir Mohammad Amerol bin Haji Metussin for being accommodative to my request to interview them for the purpose of my research despite their busy work schedule. Moreover, I thank my parents, husband, families and friends who had given continuous support during the two years journey as a Master of law student. Lastly, special thanks to my sons Muhammad 'Atta Wajdi bin Haji Muhammad Azri and Muhammad 'Imad Hamdi bin Haji Muhammad Azri who have been motivating factors pushing me to complete this research within the stipulated time frame given to me by the university. May Allah (سبحانه وتعالى) bless all of you in this world and in the Hereafter. Amin.

ABSTRACT

INCESTUOUS RAPE UNDER THE LAWS OF BRUNEI DARUSSALAM AND THE SHARIAH

Incestuous rape is the sexual abuse of a victim by a relative or other person in a position of trust. Compared to rape by stranger, incestuous rape crime is more painful as it hides secrets and dark experience faced by the victims. The major factor in an incest situation is that, within the power structure of the family, the child's needs for security, acceptance, and love are exploited in a sexual manner. This research revolves around a wide range of problems such as the absence of specific provision or section in our existing laws addressing the offence of incestuous rape, the problem of silent witnesses and the different views of the Muslim jurists on incestuous rape. Based on these problems, one of the main objectives of this research is to study the position of incestuous rape under the laws of Brunei Darussalam and the Shariah In analysing this objective, a corresponding research question is asked that is, what is the position of incestuous rape under the laws of Brunei Darussalam and the Shariah In terms of research methodology, the research adopts a doctrinal legal research and empirical approach. As to the findings, the research concludes that there is no specific legislation or separate section based on our current existing laws on incestuous rape. In addition, there is also no section in our current existing laws criminalising the act of silent witnesses such as immediate family members who are aware of the incestuous rape but decide to keep quiet. The research recommends for a new section or a separate section to specifically deal with incestuous rape. Furthermore, the research also recommends for a new section to be incorporated into our current existing laws to criminalise the act of the silent witnesses.

ABSTRAK

ROGOL SUMBANG MAHRAM DI DALAM UNDANG-UNDANG BRUNEI DARUSSALAM DAN SHARIAH

Rogol sumbang mahram adalah penderaan seksual ke atas mangsa oleh seseorang yang mempunyai ikatan persaudaraan atau mana-mana orang yang dipercayai. Jenayah rogol sumbang mahram adalah lebih perit berbanding rogol oleh orang asing kerana ia menyembunyikan rahsia gelap yang dihadapi oleh mangsa. Faktor utama dalam situasi sumbang mahram melibatkan struktur kuasa dalam keluarga di mana keperluan seorang anak untuk keselamatan, penerimaan dan kasih sayang telah dieksploitasi secara seksual. Penyelidikan ini berkisarkan ruang lingkup permasalahan yang luas, antara lain tiadanya peruntukan atau seksyen khusus dalam undang-undang sedia ada untuk menangani kesalahan rogol sumbang mahram, isu saksi-saksi yang berdiam diri dan isu berkenaan pandangan-pandangan berbeza di kalangan pakar undang-undang Islam berkaitan rogol sumbang mahram. Berdasarkan isu-isu tersebut, salah satu objektif utama penyelidikan ini adalah untuk membuat kajian berkenaan kedudukan rogol sumbang mahram di bawah undang-undang Brunei Darussalam dan undang-undang Shariah. Dalam menganalisa ojektif tersebut, soalan penyelidikan yang sepadan adalah, apakah kedudukan rogol sumbang mahram di bawah undang-undang Brunei Darussalam dan undang-undang Shariah. Kaedah penyelidikan yang digunapakai adalah kajian doktrinal undang-undang ("doctrinal legal research") dan pendekatan empirik ("empirical approach"). Manakala dapatan yang diperolehi daripada kajian ini merumuskan bahawa tiada undang-undang khusus atau seksyen yang berasingan berkaitan rogol sumbang mahram di bawah undang-undang sedia ada. Dapatan juga diperolehi bahawa tiada sebarang seksyen di bawah undang-undang sedia ada yang menjadikan satu kesalahan jenayah bagi saksi-saksi yang berdiam diri seperti ahli keluarga rapat yang mempunyai pengetahuan berkenaan rogol sumbang mahram tetapi memilih untuk berdiam diri. Kajian ini mencadangkan agar diperuntukkan seksyen baru atau undang-undang berasingan secara khusus berkenaan rogol sumbang mahram. Dapaan juga mencadangkan agar diwujudkan seksyen baru dalam undang-undang sedia ada yang memperuntukkan bahawa adalah menjadi satu kesalahan jenayah bagi saksi yang berdiam diri berkaitan rogol sumbang mahram.

ملخص البحث

اغتصاب المحارم تحت قوانين بروناي دار السلام والشريعة

اغتصاب المجارم هو الاعتداء الجنسي من عائلة قريبة أو من الذي يعطي ثقة ليعتني بالضحية. بالمقارنة مع الاغتصاب من الغرباء، فإن جربمة الاغتصاب وسفاح المجارم أكثر إيلامًا لأنما تخفي الأسرار والخبرة السيئة على الضحية. العامل الرئيسي في حالة سفاح المجارم هو حول هيكل سلطة الأسرة، احتياجات الطفل للأمان، والقبول، والحب التي تستغل بطريقة جنسية. فهذا البحث يدور حول مجموعة واسعة من المشاكل مثل عدم وجود نص أو قسم محدد في قوانيننا الحالية التي تتناول جربمة الاغتصاب وسفاح المجارم، ومشكلة الشهود الصامتين وآراء مختلفة من الفقهاء المسلمين حول اغتصاب المجارم. بناءً على هذه المشاكل، فإن الشهود الصامتين وآراء مختلفة من الفقهاء المسلمين حول اغتصاب من سفاح المجارم تحت قوانين بروناي دار السلام والشريعة. عند تحليل هذا المدف، فيُطرح سؤل؛ ما هو موقف الاغتصاب من سفاح المجارم تحت قوانين بروناي دار السلام والشريعة. أما من حيث منهجية البحث، فيعتمد البحث على البحث تحت قوانين المفقهي والنهج التحريبي، وبالنسبة إلى النتائج، فيخلص البحث إلى أنه لا يوجد تشريع محدد أو قسم منفصل بناء على قوانيننا الحالية عن الاغتصاب من سفاح المجارم. وبالإضافة إلى ذلك، لا يوجد أي قسم يقوانيننا الحالية الذي يجرم فعل الشهود الصامتين مثل أفراد الأسرة الأقربين الذين يعونون الاغتصاب من سفاح المجارم لكنهم قرروا الصمت. فيوصي البحث على قسم جديد في قوانيننا الحالية لتحريم فعل الشهود خاصة اغتصاب المجارم، كما يوصي كذلك على إدراج قسم جديد في قوانيننا الحالية لتحريم فعل الشهود الصامتين.

TABLE OF CONTENT

CON	TENT	PAGE
SUPE	ERVISION	ii
DECI	_ARATION	iii
_	LARATION OF COPYRIGHT AND AFFIRMATION OF FAIR USE O	
UNPU	JBLISHED RESEARCH	iv
ACK	NOWLEDGEMENT	v
ABST	TRACT	vi
ABST	TRAK	vii
البحث	ملخص	viii
TABI	LE OF CONTENT	ix
LIST	OF TABLES	xiii
LIST	OF TRANSLITERATION	xiv
ABBI	REVIATION	xvi
LIST	OF CASES	xvii
LIST	OF STATUTES	xix
CHAI	PTER ONE	1
INTR	ODUCTION	1
1.1	Background of the Study	1
1.2	Statement of the problem	9
1.3	Research Questions	12
1.4	Research Objectives	13
1.5	Importance of Research	13
1.6	Research Methodology	14
1.7	Research Scope and Limitations	15
1.8	Chapterization	17
1.9	Literature Review	18
1.10	Conclusion	21
CHAI	PTER TWO	22
LAW	S GOVERNING INCESTUOUS RAPE IN BRUNEI DARUSSALAM	22
2.1	Introduction	22
2.2	The Laws of Brunei Darussalam's History	23

2.3	History of Rape	23
2.4	The Crime of Incest	25
2.5	Legendary Story of Incest Crime in Brunei Darussalam 2.5.1 Laws of Brunei Darussalam 2.5.2 Brunei Penal Code	28
	2.5.3 Criminal Procedure Code, Chapter 7	
2.6	Religious Council Kadi's Court Act	38
2.7	Shari'ah Penal Code Order 2013	39
2.8	Relevant Cases	45
2.9	Conclusion	49
СН	IAPTER THREE	51
ТН	E OFFENCE OF INCESTUOUS RAPE	51
3.1		
3.2		
3.3	-	
د.د	3.3.1 The Commission of Act Should Be Against the Victim's Will	
	3.3.2 It is Non-Consensual or Without the Victim's Consent	
	Obtained Through Putting the Victim into Fear of Death or Hurt 3.3.4 Consent is Obtained Because the Victim Believes That He is Another Man. The Victim Believes That Man is Another Man to Whom Sh	ie is
	Lawfully Married	
3.4		
J. 1	3.4.1 Sexual Intercourse or Sexual Penetration	
3.5	Incest: The Elements	76
3.6		
	3.6.1 Malaysia	
	3.6.2 Singapore	83
3.7	Procedure in Handling Incestuous Rape Cases in Brunei Darussalam	86
3.8		
	3.8.1 Impact on the Victim Herself	
	3.8.2 Impact on the Family	
	3.8.4 Impact on the Society at Large	
3.9	1	
ر. ر	3.9.1 Not Covering the Aurah	
	3.9.2 Physiological and Psychological Needs	103
	3.9.3 Boundaries of Relationship between Father and Daughter	
	3 9 4 Mass Media Influence	104

3	3.9.5	Lack of faith or knowledge about Islamic thought	105
3.10	Concl	usion	105
		R FOUR	
		ENCE OF INCESTUOUS RAPE IN SHARIAH	
4.1		roduction	
4.2		e Offence of Zina in Shariah	
4.2			
		xistan Cases Pertaining to the Issues of Rajm	
4.4	1no 4.4.1	e Modes of Proving the Offence of Zinā according to Shari'ah Testimony from the Witness	
	.4.2	Witness Must Be A Muslim	
	1.4.3	Witness Must Be Baligh	
	1.4.4	Witness Must Be Sane	
4	1.4.5	Witness Must Credible (Adil)	
4	.4.6	Witness Must Be Able to See	
4	.4.7	Witness Must Be Able to Talk	116
4	.4.8	Witness Must Able to Remember	116
4	.4.9	No Obstacles for the Witness to Give Testimony	117
4.5	Otl	ner Conditions for Witness in Zinā Cases	119
	1.5.1	Four Witnesses	
4	1.5.2	Male	
4	1.5.3	Direct Evidence	121
4	1.5.4	Evidence Given Shall Not Be Delayed	121
4	.5.5	Evidence Must Be Given in One Event	122
4	.5.6	The Judges Satisfied With the Testimony Given	122
4	1.5.7	The Possibility of the Convict to Commit Zinā	123
4	1.5.8	Able to Reject the Prosecution	123
4	1.5.9	The Qualification Being A Witness is Maintained until Hadd Punish	
		is Given to the Convict	123
4	1.5.10	Free From Slavery	124
4.6	Co	nfession from the Convicted Person or Accused	124
4.7	Cir	cumstantial Evidence	126
4.8	The	e Punishment for Zinā in Shari'ah	133
4.9	The	e Punishment of Whipping	134
4.10	Mo	des of Applying the Execution of Whipping in Shari'ah	135
4.11	The	e Punishment of Rajm	137
		Debate among the Muslim Scholars in Regards to the Punishment o	
			-
4	.11.2	Modes of the Execution of Rajm in Accordance to Shari'ah	142
4.12	7in	ā bi al-Jabr in Shari'ah	143
		Issue of Whether Zinā Bi al-Jabr Falls under Zinā	
		Punishment for Zinā bil Jabr	

4.12.3 Zinā bil-Jabr Liable to Hadd of Zina	146
4.12.4 Zinā Bil Jabr Liable to Ta'zir	148
4.12.5 Zinā Bil Jabr Liable to Hirābah	148
4.13 Conclusion	150
CHAPTER FIVE	151
FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS	152
5.1 Research Findings	152
5.2 Recommendations	153
5.3 Suggestion for Further Recommendation	155
BIBLIOGRAPHY	157

LIST OF TABLES

NUMBER	TITLE	PAGE
Table 1.1	The statistic of Brunei Darussalam's incestuous rape from 2014-2017	3
Table 2.1	ble 2.1 The comparison between punishment before and after the amendment	
Table 2.2 The Statistic on Rape and Incestuous Rape in Brunei Darussalam (2014-2017)		37

LIST OF TRANSLITERATION

Transliteration Table

Arabic / الحروف العربية	/ Roman الكتابة بالحروف الرومانية	الأمثلة / Example	/ Transliteration الكتابة الحرفية
ç	,	فقهاء	fuqahā'
ب	b	البخاري الترمذي	al- B ukhārī
ت	t	الترمذي	at- Tirmidhī
ث	th	الحديث	al- hadi th
ج	j	جريمة	j arīmah
ح	ķ	الحد	al- ḥ add
خ	kh	خندق	kh andaq
د	d	الدليل	ad- d alīl
ذ	dh	ذمي	dhimmī
ر	r	رسول الله	R asūlullah
ز	z	زنا	zinā
س	S	الأسلأمي	al-a s lami
ىش	sh	الشافعي	as- Sh āfi ^c ī
ص	ş	الأسلأمي الشافعي إحصان وضوء	Ih ṣ ān
ض	d	وضوء	wu ḍ u
ط	ţ	وطء	wa ţ 'i
ظ	Ż	ظهار	z ihar
ع	С	تعزير	ta ^c zir
غ	gh	المغني	al-Mu gh nī
ف	f	المغني فراق	faraq
ق	q	القصد	al- q asd
5)	k	الكاساني لعان	al- K āsānī
J	1	لعان	Li⁰an

م	m	مميز	Mumaiyyiz
ن	n	النكاح	an-Nikāh
ه, ه	h	هارون / شهادة	Hārūn / shahādah
و	w	النووي	an- N awawī
ي	у	اليمين	al-Yamīn

Short Vowel

Arabic	Roman	Example	Transliteration
ं	a	كَتَبَ	kataba
<u>\$</u>	i	سمِع	sa mi °a
<u></u>	u	رُنع	rufi⁰a

Long Vowel

Arabic	Roman	Example	Transliteration
ا\ ي	ā	بَاب	b ā b
ِ ي	ī	صيغة	s ī ghah
<i>أ</i> و	ū	مجنون	majn ū n

Dipthong

Arab	Latin	Contoh	Transliterasi
وَ	aw	قَول	qawl
्र ्	ay	بَين	b ay na
يّ	iyy	البيّنة	al-ba iyy inah
وّ	uww	قوّة	q uww ah

Exemptions

Some of the Arabic term is in accordance with the provisions of the law.

ABBREVIATION

BLR Brunei Law Report

Chap / Cap Chapter

CLJ Current Law Journal (Malaysia)

Ed. Editor ed. Edition

ibid ion beam induced deposition

JCBD Judgement of Brunei Darussalam

KL Kuala Lumpur

MLJ Malaysian Law Journal

n.d no date / year

NBD Negara Brunei Darussalam

No. Number

n.pl No publisher

Op.cit Opus citatum est

p. PagesSec. / S Section

UK United Kingdom, London

V Verse
Vol. Volume
... etc et cetera

LIST OF CASES

Abdul Malek bin Atan v PP [2002] 4 MLJ 84 (HC)

Bree [2007] EWCA Crim 804, [2007] 2 All ER 676, CA

Corbett V Corbett [1970] 2 All ER 33

DPP v Morgan [1976] AC 182 [House of Lords]

Fakhrul Azman bin Awang Magani v Public Prosecutor (Criminal Appeal No.44 of 2014, Attorney General Library's Copy)

Federation of Pakistan v Hazoor Bakhsh PLD 1 1983 FSC 255

Hazoor Bakhsh v Federation of Pakistan PLD 1981 FSC 145

Jamaluddin bin Hashim v Public Prosecutor [1999] 4 MLJ 1

Jehan Mina v. State 35 P.L.D. 1983 F.S.C. 183 (1983),

Kuldeep K Mahato AIR 1998 SC 2694

Mohammad Ehsan Niezam v Public Prosecutor (Criminal Appeal No 17 of 2016, Attorney General Library's Copy)

Public Prosecutor v Hibatul Wafi bin Mahari (High Court Revision No.35 of 2013, Judgements Court of Brunei Darussalam)

Public Prosecutor v RBAHI (High Court Revision No. 17 of 2015, Judgements Court of Brunei Darussalam)

Public Prosecutor v JBJ (High Court Revision No. 5 of 2014, Judgements Court of Brunei Darussalam)

Public Prosecutor v RBAHI (High Court Revision No. 17 of 2015, Judgement Court of Brunei Darussalam)

Public Prosecutor v P bin Hj P (Intermediate Court Revision No.7 of 2006, Judgements Court of Brunei Darussalam)

Public Prosecutor v Muhamad Ratino bin Abdullah Litoh (High Court Revision No 12 of 2014, Judgements Court of Brunei Darussalam)

Public Prosecutor v Hamran bin Bakar (Criminal Appeal Revision No 6 of 2016, Judgements Court of Brunei Darussalam)

PP v Abdul Rahim bin Haji Ahmad & Ors [1998] BLR 143

Public Prosecutor v Zainal Abidin bin Ismail [1987] 2 MLJ 741

PP v Suhaimi bin Nickman [1993] BLR 139 (CA)

Public Prosecutor v Metussin, Billy [1993] BLR 366 (HC)

Public Prosecutor v M.S [2005] 2 BLR 233

Public Prosecutor v Abdullah Sani bin Kafli (High Court Criminal Revision No. 19 of 2004, Judgements Court of Brunei Darussalam)

Public Prosecutor v A.S bin K (High Court Criminal Revision No. 3 of 2017, Judgements Court of Brunei Darussalam)

Queen Empress v Gopala [1896] Rat Un Cri C 865

R v Flattery (1877) 2 QBD 410

Rafaqat Bibi v. State N.L.R. 1984 S.D. 165 (F.S.C. 1984)

Safia Bibi v. State 37 P.L.D. 1985 F.S.C. 120 (1983)

Sakina v. State 33 P.L.D. 1981 F.S.C. 320 (1981).

State of Maharashtra v Prakash AIR [1992] SC 1275

The State v Sarfaraz S.C. 233 of 2004

The State v Muhammad Iqbal S.C. 414 of 2008.

The State v Mehmood Ahmed S.C. 399 of 2009

Vijayan Pillai [1990] 1 Crimes 261 (Ker)

LIST OF STATUTES

Laws of Brunei

Criminal Procedure Code, Cap 7

Evidence Act, Cap 108

Penal Code, Cap 22

Religious Council and Kadis Court Act, Cap 77

Shari'ah Penal Code Order 2013

Other laws

Malaysia Penal Code

Singapore Penal Code

CHAPTER ONE

INTRODUCTION

1.1 Background of the Study

Incestuous relationship is sexual intercourse between those persons who are closely related and as a result are prohibited to marry each other.¹

The term incest refers to sexual contact between family members. Meanwhile, Vanderbilt, Erbilt, has defined incest as "...the sexual abuse of a child by a relative or other person in a position of trust and authority over the child. It is a violation of the child where he or she lives -- literally and metaphorically. A child molested by a stranger can run home for help and comfort. A victim of incest cannot."²

From the above definition of the term 'incest', it provides an understanding about non-consensual incestuous relationship. Those who are raped by stranger can still consider home as a safe place but not for the victim of incest who will always live in fear. Compared to rape by stranger, incest crime is more painful as it hides secrets and dark experience faced by the victim.³

There is also no separate section which specifically discussed on incestuous rape but that offence is categorized under the category of *zinā* bi al-Jabr in Brunei Darussalam Shari'ah Penal Code under section 75.

Rape or *zinā bi al-Jabr* is defined as "a person (A) commits rape if he intentionally penetrates the vagina, anus or mouth of another person (B) with his penis,

¹ Dato' Hj Mohammad Shariff bin Haji Abu Samah, Datin Hjh Asidah binti Hj Mohd Ali. (2002). *Alman Criminal Law in Malaysia*. Malaysia: Syarikat Percitakan Ihsan. p.375.

² Hamid Ibrahim and Naseer Hamid. (2008). *Rape & Incest, cases and Materials*. Petaling Jaya: Gravel Publication. p.5.

³ Prof. Dr Anwarullah. (2008). *The Criminal Law of Islam*. 3rd ed. Kuala Lumpur, Malaysia. p.119.

B does not consent to the penetration and A does not reasonably believe that B consents."⁴ This is based on English's law definition. However, in Brunei Darussalam the definition of rape can be seen from section 375 of the Brunei Penal Code⁵. The section defines the offence of rape as follows:

- 375. A man is said to commit "rape", who, except in the case hereinafter excepted, has sexual intercourse with a woman under circumstances falling under any of the 5 following descriptions:
 - (a) against her will;
 - (b) without her consent;
 - (c) with her consent, when her consent has been obtained by putting her in fear of death or of hurt;
 - (d) with her consent, when the man knows that he is not he husband, and that her consent is given because she believes that he is another man to whom she is, or believes herself to be, lawfully married;
 - (e) with or without her consent when she is under 14 years of age.

Explanation - Penetration is sufficient to constitute the sexual intercourse necessary to the offence of rape.

Exception - Sexual intercourse by a man with his own wife, the wife not being under 13 years of age, is not rape.

The difference between the English's law definition and definition under the Brunei Penal Code Order is that the former definition focuses more on penetrations that includes penetration of the victim's mouth which is not available in the Brunei Penal Code.

Many of the victims do not report the crime because they are afraid of the accused. In addition, they feel ashamed and have no knowledge about the law. This crime has ruined many of the victim's life. This sexual abuse within family has been

⁴ Mick Woodley. (2009). *Osborn's Concise Law Dictionary*. 11th ed. United Kingdom: Thomson Reuters (Legal) Limited. p.343.

⁵ Negara Brunei Darussalam (1951). Penal Code. (Revised Edition 2001). Chapter 22.

proven to be the root cause of other social diseases such as prostitution, homosexual, robbery, murder and etc.⁶

Due to the seriousness of incestuous rape crime, law plays an important role to prevent such crime. Prior to the coming of the British to Brunei Darussalam, Brunei has been governed by Islamic Law which was in a codified form. There were two manuscripts known as "Hukum Kanun Brunei" (which was kept at Language and Literature Bureau) and "Undang-Undang dan Adat Brunei Lama" (which is now kept in Sarawak).⁷

Based on the brief information above, this research is indeed timely as it aims to study incestuous rape under the Laws of Brunei Darussalam and the Shariah. This is because this country needs a clear interpretation and application, i.e. Brunei Penal Code and the Shari'ah Penal Code Order 2013. Research will focus on examining, the methodology of proving the offence and punishment of incestuous rape crime based on the opinions of different Muslim scholars.

As mentioned in *Public Prosecutor v RBHI*, incestuous rape has provided a lot of negative effects. It is regarded as undeniably a degrading, humiliating and a brutal invasion of a person's most intimate private space. The serious nature of the crime upon the young victim will cause emotional and psychological trauma on the victim.⁸ The statistic for rape and incestuous rape can be seen as follows:

Table 1.1

The statistic of Brunei Darussalam's incestuous rape cases from 2014 to 2017

Year	Rape Cases	Incestuous Rape Cases	Relationship	No. of Cases
2014	20	7	Uncle	4
			Father	2
			Step Father	1
2015	25	6	Father	5
			Step Father	1
2016	26	8	Uncle	3

⁶ Azizah Othman, Azelin Aziz. (n.d). Fenomena Sumbang Mahram di Kalangan Masyarakat Islam di Malaysia, Retrieved from http://repo.uum.edu.my/1815/. [date of access: 30/10/2017]

3

⁷ Azrimah binti Haji Abdul Rahman. (n.d). Working Paper for International Day Seminar 2006. "Legal System in Brunei Darussalam After the Signing of Supplementary Agreement 1905/1906 between Brunei & Great Britain". Retrieved from http://www.bruneiresources.com/pdf/nd06_azrimah.pdf [date of access: 30/10/2017]

⁸ (High Court of Brunei Darussalam) (Criminal Trial No. 17 of 2015)

			Grandfather	2
			Father	2
			Step Father	1
2017	26	9	Father	4
			Brother	2
			Stepfather	1
			Grandfather	1
			Uncle	1

^{*}Source: ASP Mohammad Amerol bin Haji Metussin, Criminal Investigation Department Bandar Seri Begawan (2018, May 9th). Personal Interview.

Furthermore, Brunei Darussalam practises a dualistic court system. There are two laws available such as Islamic law as well as Civil law. This research will only focus on the statutes related to the crime of incest such as the Brunei Penal Code and the Brunei Shari'ah Penal Code Order 2013.

There are three important sections in the Brunei Darussalam Penal Code pertaining to this crime which is governed under sections 375, 376 and 377A of the Brunei Darussalam Penal Code. By virtue of section 375 of Penal Code⁹, it states that:

"A man is said to commit "rape", who, except in the case hereinafter excepted, has sexual intercourse with a woman under circumstances falling under any of the five following descriptions:

- (a) against her will;
- (b) without her consent;
- (c) with her consent, when her consent has been obtained by putting her in fear of death or of hurt;
- (d) with her consent, when the man knows that he is not her husband, and that her consent is given because she believes that he is another man to whom she is, or believes herself to be, lawfully married;
- (e) with or without her consent when she is under the age of 14 years.

⁹ Negara Brunei Darussalam (1951). Penal Code. (Revised Edition 2001). Chapter 22.

Explanation - Penetration is sufficient to constitute the sexual intercourse necessary to the offence of rape.

Exception - Sexual intercourse by a man with his own wife, the wife not being under the age of 13 years, is not rape.

The first clause operates, where the woman is in possession of her senses, and therefore capable of consenting but the act is done against her will. The second clause means the act is done without her consent. Meanwhile, the third, fourth and the fifth clauses provide that there is consent but it is not an excuse for the offender. Subject to third clause, consent is obtained by putting the victim or any person in whom she is interested in fear of, death, or of hurt. In the fourth clause, it is a situation where the accused had knowledge that he is not her husband and the victim consented because she believed herself to be lawfully married to the accused. The fifth clause provides that where the intercourse is with a girl so young that consent is immaterial ¹⁰

The above clauses have explained the elements to be fulfilled in order to constitute the offence rape. This is applicable to both Muslims and non-Muslims for any sexual abuse. The offence of rape in this section is without consent or by force. It is rape in general without giving a specification whether it is rape done by a stranger or by the family member themselves.

The punishment for rape is provided under section 376 of the Brunei Darussalam Penal Code¹¹ and it states that:

- (1) Subject to subsections (2), (3), and (4), whoever commits rape shall be punished with imprisonment for a term which may extend to 30 years and whipping.
- (2) Whoever -
 - (a) in order to commit or to facilitate the commission of an offence of rape against a women -
 - (i) voluntarily causes hurt to her or to any other person; or

¹⁰ Ratanlal and Dhirajlal's. (2000). *Law of Crimes*. 26th ed. New Delhi: Bharat Law House. p.1781.

¹¹ Negara Brunei Darussalam (1951). Penal Code. (Revised Edition 2001). Chapter 22.

- (ii) puts her in fear of death or hurt to herself or any other person;
- (b) commits rape against a woman under 14 years of age; or
- (c) is in a position of trust or authority towards a woman or is a person with whom the woman is in a relationship of dependency, commits rape against a woman, Shall be punished with imprisonment for a term of not less than 10 years and not more than 30 years and whipping with not less than 12 strokes.
- (3) Whoever commits rape against a woman under 14 years of age:
 - (a) voluntarily causes hurt to her or to any other person,
 - (b) puts her in fear of death or hurt to herself or any other person;
 - (c) is in a position of trust or authority towards her is a person whom she is in a relationship of dependency, shall be punished with imprisonment for a term of not less than 15 years and not more than 30 years and whipping with not less than 12 strokes.
- (4) Any person who is convicted of an offence under this section shall, in the case of a second or subsequent conviction, be punished with imprisonment for a term not less than 20 years and not more than 50 years and whipping not less than 20 strokes.
- (5) In any case in which section 258 of the Criminal Procedure Code [Chapter 7] applies, the Court shall sentence the offender, instead of whipping to imprisonment for a term which may extend to 12 months, in addition to the punishment to which he has been sentenced under this section".

In addition, section 377A of the Penal Code¹² deals with the offence of incest and it states that:

"(1) Whoever -

¹² Negara Brunei Darussalam (1951). Penal Code. (Revised Edition 2001). Chapter 22.

- (a) being a male, has sexual intercourse with a female who to his knowledge is his mother, grandmother, granddaughter, daughter, sister or half-sister; or
- (b) being a female has sexual intercourse with a male who to her knowledge is her father, grandfather, grandson, son, brother or half-brother,

is said to commit "incest" and shall be punished with imprisonment for a term not exceeding 10 years and fine.

Explanation - It is immaterial whether the relationship between the persons charged is or is not traced through lawful wedlock.

(2) This section does not apply to Malays and other races indigenous to Brunei Darussalam who by their own law or custom are punishable for having sexual intercourse within prohibited degrees of relationship.

The above section provides for incestuous crime committed consensually by the non-Muslims. The accused will be held liable if they have knowledge about their blood relationship. There is no defence to say that their relationship is consensual. However, they will not be held liable under this section if they had no knowledge about their blood relationship. In other words, it is a defence for the accused to prove that he or she did not know the relationship was of such nature. 14

Moreover, subject to section 377A (2), the section does not apply to the Malay Community. The Malay Community of Brunei Darussalam is governed by section 178 (3) of the Religious Council and Kadis Court [Chap 77]¹⁵ wherein the punishment for incest for a male person is imprisonment for 5 years and for a female person imprisonment for one year. This section is only applicable to consensual cases. So far, the Shari'ah court has not received any cases of incestuous relationship as there are no

¹³ Professor Dr Mohd Altaf Hussain Ahanger. (n.d) *Sexual Offences Lecture*. Brunei Darussalam: Universiti Islam Sultan Sharif Ali.

¹⁴ Stanley Yeo, Neil Morgan, *at el.* (2010). *Criminal law in Malaysia and Singapore*. 2nd edition. Singapore: C.O.S Printers Pte. Ltd. p.366.

¹⁵ Negara Brunei Darussalam (1984). Religious Council and Kadis Court. (Revised 1984) Chapter 77.

reports have been lodged or made. According to Ustazah Hajah Noraida, this is because they only work on reported cases. ¹⁶

It is important to note that although section 377A of the Brunei Penal Code deals with incestuous relationship, the application is only limited to the non-Muslims. Hence, this research is to study the position of incestuous rape under laws of Brunei Darussalam and Shariah It is further to identify a separate legislation specifically on incestuous rape under the Brunei Penal Code for addressing incestuous rape which is committed by Muslim community.

Regardless of the discussion above i.e. on section 377A of the Brunei Darussalam Penal Code regarding its scope, section 76 of the Brunei Darussalam Shari'ah Penal Code Order 2013¹⁷ deals with *zinā bi al-Jabr* (known as rape in English context) which this includes incestuous rape. Hence, Muslims who commit incestuous rape can be punished under the Order. The punishment is stated under section 76 of the Order which is as follows:

- 76. (1) Any person who commits *zinā* bi al-Jabr and is proved either by *ikrar* of the accused, or by *syahadah* of at least four *syahid* according to Hukum Syara' other than the evidence of the victim after the Court is satisfied having regard to the requirements of *tazkiyah* al-syuhud is guilty of an offence and shall be liable on conviction to had punishment as follows:
 - (a) if he is *muhsan*, stoning to death witnessed by a group of Muslims;
 - (b) if he is *ghairu muhsan*, whipping with 100 strokes witnessed by a group of Muslim and to imprisonment for one year.
 - (2) Any person who commits *zinā bi al-Jabr* and it is proved by evidence other than that provided under subsection (1) is guilty of an offence and shall be liable on conviction -

¹⁶ Ustazah Nooraida binti Haji Timpus, Bahagian Penyelidikan. Mahkamah Syariah Bandar Seri Begawan. (2017, September 16). Personal Interview.

¹⁷ Negara Brunei Darussalam (2013). Syariah Penal Code Order 2013. (Revised Edition 2013).

- (a) if he is *muhsan*, to imprisonment for a term not exceeding 30 years and whipping with not exceeding 40 strokes;
- (b) if he is *ghairu muhsan*, to imprisonment for a term not exceeding 15 years and whipping with not exceeding 20 strokes.

The above section refers to the punishment for rape which also includes incestuous rape. Even under the Order there is no section which discusses specifically on incestuous rape. The law refers to $hadd^{18}$ punishment as well as $ta'zir^{19}$ punishment for rape in general.

Due to the different views put forward by Muslim scholars pertaining to rape crime, this research has to study the position of incestuous rape under the laws of Brunei and the Shariah It further identifies a separate legislation pertaining to incestuous rape based on the opinion of different Muslim scholars. This includes the methodology of proving the offence as well as its punishment.

1.2 Statement of the problem

Prior to the full implementation of Shari'ah law in Brunei Darussalam, penal offences such as rape, robbery etc. are heard under the jurisdiction of the civil courts by making reference to penal provisions of the Brunei Darussalam Penal Code, which we have inherited from the British. However, following the full implementation of Brunei Darussalam Shari'ah Penal Code Order 2013 on 3rd April 2019, provisions under the Brunei Darussalam Penal Code Order can be used now as *ta'zir* punishment for a case where the evidence is not sufficient. Hence, provision for incestuous rape in which the evidence is not sufficient will be heard under the jurisdiction of civil court. Since there is no specific provision on incestuous rape, it means that rape by a stranger or rape committed by a family member will still face the same type of punishment.

Moreover, an amendment was made to section 376 which now provides for an increased minimum punishment of 10 years' imprisonment and 12 whipping where an

¹⁸ It is an Arabic word meaning "borders, boundaries, limits. In the religion of Islam it refers to punishments that under Islamic law (shari'ah) are mandated and fixed by Allah.

¹⁹ In Islamic Law, tazir (or ta'zir, Arabic تعزير) refers to punishment for offenses at the discretion of the judge (Qadi) or ruler of the state.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

Al-Qurān Al-Karīm.

English References:

- Anwarullah, Prof. Dr. (2008). The Criminal Law of Islam. 3rd ed. Kuala Lumpur: n.pb.
- Card, Richard. Card, Cross and Jones. (2008). Criminal Law. 18th ed. New York: n.pb.
- Crofts, Penny. (2005). Essential Criminal Law. 3rd ed. Australia: Cavendish Publishing.
- Davenport Esq, Anniken. (2006). *Basic Criminal Law: The US constitution, Procedure and Crimes*. United States: Pearson Prentice.
- Eisa At-Tirmidhi, Imam Hafiz Abu Eisa Mohammad. (n.d). *Jami At-Tirmidhi*. Vol 3. n.pl: Dar-us-salam.
- Gardner, Thomas J and Anderson, Terry M. (2014). *Criminal Law.* 11th ed. United Stated of America: Wadsworth Cangage Learning.
- Ibrahim, Hamid and Hamid, Naseer. (2008). *Rape & Incest, cases and Materials*. Petaling Jaya: Gravel Publication.
- Ladin, Muhammad Akram. (2014). *Islamic law: An Introduction*. 5th ed. Malaysia: IIUM Press.
- Law, Jonathan and Martin, Elizabeth A. (2009). *Oxford dictionary of Law*. 7th ed. United Kingdom: Market House Book Ltd.
- Mohamad Yunus, Mohamad Ismail. (2014). *A Commentary on Criminal Law & Evidence*. Kuala Lumpur: n.pb.
- Mohd Altaf Hussain Ahanger, Professor. Dr. (n.d). *Sexual Offences Lecture*. Brunei Darussalam: Universiti Islam Sultan Sharif Ali.
- O'Reilly, Martin. (2015). Is Adult Incest Wrong? Ireland: Humanisam.
- Othman, Mahmud Saedon A. (1996). *An Introduction to Islamic Law of Evidence*. 1st ed. Kuala Lumpur: Hazrah Enterprise.
- Rahman Al-Mubarakpuri, Shaykh Safiur (2003) . *Tafsir Ibn Kathir* (Abridged vol 7). 2nd ed. n.pl: Maktaba Dar-us-Salam.
- Rasheed, Sanaa and Zaman, Sarah. (2012). With an End in Sight Incest in Pakistan: A Legal & Socio-cultural Analysis. War Against Rape. Karachi: n.pb.
- Ratanlal and Dhirajlal's. (2000). Law of Crimes. 26th ed. New Delhi: Bharat Law House.
- Sri Ram, Gopal and Paul, Augustine. (Eds). (2002). *Malal's Penal Law*. Malaysia: Conita Sc Leung.
- Woodley, Mick. (2009) *Osborn's Concise Law Dictionary*. 11th ed. United Kingdom: Thomson Reuters (Legal) Limited.
- Wallace, Harvey and Roberson, Cliff. (2008). *Principle of Criminal Law*.4th ed. United States: Publisher's Design and Production. Services Inc.

Yeo, Stanley, Morgan, Neil and Cheong, Chan Wing. (2010). *Criminal Law in Malaysia and Singapore*. 2nd ed. Singapore: C.O.S Printers Pte. Ltd.

Malay References:

- Awang Abdul Aziz Juned, Pehin Dato Seri Maharaja Dato Paduka Seri Setia Dr Ustaz Haji. (2014). *The Shari 'ah Penal Code An Introduction*. 2nd ed. Brunei Darussalam: State Mufti's Office.
- Jamaluddin, Siti Zaharah and Nor Aini, Datin. (n.d). *Undang-Undang Jenayah di Malaysia*. Kuala Lumpur: Penerbit-penerbit Buku Malaysia.
- Mat Saad Abd Rahman, Dr. (1993). *Undang-Undang Jenayah Islam Jenayah Hudud*. Shah Alam: As Noordeen.
- Mohammad Shariff Haji Abu Samah, Dato' Hj and Asidah Hj Mohd Ali, Datin Hjh. (2012). *Alman Criminal Law in Malaysia*. Malaysia: Syarikat Percitakan Ihsan.
- Wahbah Al-Zuhaili. (1994). Fiqh dan Perundangan Islam Jilid VI. Kuala Lumpur: Dewan Bahasa dan Pustaka.

Thesis:

- Dyg Hajah Suhana Haji Sudin. (2014). "Kesalahan-Kesalahan Seksual dan Hukuman di bawah Perintah Kanun Hukuman Jenayah Syariah 2013 dan Kanun Hukuman Jenayah Penggal 22 Satu Tinjauan". Diploma's Thesis. Universiti Islam Sultan Sharif Ali.
- Hajah Suriati Haji Ali Yusof. (2006). "Rogol: Kes Kajian di Negara Brunei Darussalam." Diploma's Thesis. Universiti Brunei Darussalam.
- Muhammad Azlan Pengarah Haji Ibrahim. (2013). "Jenayah Rogol di Negara Brunei Darussalam". Universiti Brunei Darussalam.
- Muhammad 'Arif Haji Kamis. (2012). "The Legal Concept of Incest in Brunei Darussalam: An Analytical Study." Degree's Thesis. Universiti Islam Sultan Sharif Ali.
- Nurul Siti Diyana Abdullah. (2011). "In Rape Cases, It is Dangerous to Act on the Evidence of the Complainant Alone: A Critically Analysis." Degree's Thesis. Universiti Islam Sultan Sharif Ali.
- Widad Haji Abdul Aziz. (2015). "Theoretical Framework of Evidentiary Rules and Punishments for Sexual Offences in Islamic Law: The Extent of its Application in Brunei Darussalam." PhD's Thesis. Universiti Islam Sultan Sharif Ali.
- Zuraini Haji Sharbawi. (2004). "Persetubuhan Haram dan Rogol dalam Perundangan Jenayah Islam dan Perlaksanaannya di Negara Brunei Darussalam". Diploma's Thesis. Universiti Brunei Darussalam.

Printed Articles and Journals:

- Awang Yusoff Haji Awang Ismail, Dato Seri Setia Haji. (2013). "Pendidikan Melayu Islam Beraja: Ke Arah Melahirkan Belia Brunei Cemerlang". Universiti Islam Sultan Sharif Ali.
- Helwa Mohammad Zainal and Dr Jasri. (2012). "Ulasan Buku: Hudud: Hukuman dan Perlaksanaan". 2 ShLR IXIX.
- Khushal I Virbhute, Professor Dr. (1998). "Incest and the law in Malaysia: Some reflections on the existing and proposed criminal law". 4 MLJ.
- Roosniza Mohd Shariff. (2005). "Penalties and Attitudes in Preventing Rape". 1 MLJ. IVII.

Online Articles and Journals:

- Abbas Mohammed Fagachi. (n.d). An Appraisal of the Application of the Punishment of the Crime of Zina in Nigeria. Retrieved from http://kubanni.abu.edu.ng/jspui/bitstream/123456789/7184/1/AN%20APPRAISA L%20OF%20THE%20APPLICATION%20OF%20THE%20PUNISHMENT%20 OF%20THE%20CRIME%20OF%20ZINA%20IN%20NIGERIA.pdf [date of access: 30/03/2019]
- Alan Hall and Margaret Manins. (n.d). In Loco Parentis and the Professional Responsibilities of Teachers. Retrieved from https://pdfs.semanticscholar.org/c82c/ce04396a558dcf4c114e50e31dbe1a3aed0e.p df [date of access: 14/04/2019]
- Azizah Othman and Azelin Aziz. (2017). Fenomena Sumbang Mahram di Kalangan Masyarakat Islam di Malaysia. Retrieved from http://repo.uum.edu.my/1815/ [date of access: 30/10/2017].
- Azrimah Haji Abdul Rahman. (2006). Legal System in Brunei Darussalam after the Signing of Supplementary Agreement 1905/1906 between Brunei & Great Britain. Retrieved from http://www.bruneiresources.com/pdf/nd06_azrimah.pdf [date of access: 30/10/2017].
- Azman Mohd Noor, Dr. (2009). Punishment for Rape in Islamic Law. 5 MLJ CXIV. Retrieved from http://irep.iium.edu.my/16877/1/PUNISHMENT_FOR_RAPE_IN_ISLAMIC_LA W.pdf [date of access: 22/10/2017].
- Evelyne Josse. (n.d). They Came with Two Guns: The Consequences of Sexual Violence for the Mental Health of Women in Armed Conflicts. Retrieved from file:///C:/Users/User/Downloads/irrc-877-josse%20(1).pdf [date of access: 11/03/2019]
- Himanshu Pandey and Priyanka Dhar. Collection of Rape Evidence in India An Analysis. https://medcraveonline.com/FRCIJ/FRCIJ-06-00245.pdf [date of access: 10/03/2019]
- Lily Zakiyah Munir. (n.d). General Introduction to Islamic Law. Retrieved from http://www.lfip.org/laws718/docs/lily-pdf/Introduction_to_Islamic_Law.pdf [date of access: 30/03/2019]

- Martin Lau. (n.d). Twenty-Five Years of Hudood Ordinances A Review. Retrieved from http://law2.wlu.edu/deptimages/Law%20Review/64-4Lau.pdf [date of access: 30/03/2019]
- Mohamad Faizal Mohammad and Mohd Zaki Ishak. (n.d). Gejala Hubungan Seks dalam Kalangan Pelajar: Satu Kajian Kes. Retrieved from https://www.ums.edu.my/fpp/images/download/proseding_skik2014/Mohamad_F aizal.pdf [date of access: 10/03/2019]
- Sohaib Mukhtar. (n.d). In Defense of the Codification of the Islamic Law of Hudud into the Law of Pakistan. Retrieved from http://www.qscience.com/doi/pdf/10.5339/irl.2016.11 [date of access: 04/10/2018]
- Sanaz Alasti. (n.d). Comparative Study of Stoning Punishment in the Religions of Islam and Judaism. Retrieved from http://www.cjcj.org/uploads/cjcj/documents/comparative_study_0.pdf [date of access: 14/04/2019]
- Ustazah Sabariah Haji Salleh. (n.d). Sumbang Mahram: Suatu perbincangan. Retrieved from http://www.jais.gov.my/article/sumbang-mahram-suatu-perbincangan [date of access: 22/10/2017]
- Zafar Iqbal Kalanauri. (n.d). A Review of Zina Laws in Pakistan. Retrieved from http://www.zklawassociates.com/wp-content/uploads/2012/03/A-Review-of-Zina-Laws-in-Pakistan.pdf [date of access: 30/03/2019]
- Zanirah Mustafa@Busu, Sıtı Fatimah Tasir and Nor Asmira Mat Jusoh. (n.d). The Concept of Aurah: Islamic Dressing Code and Personal Grooming According to Fiqh Law. Retrieved from https://journale-academiauitmt.uitm.edu.my/v2/images/vol7issue2/PID149-THECONCEPTOFAURAH.pdf [date of access: 10/03/2019]

Internet:

- Brunei Darussalam Implements Syariah Law. Retrieved from http://www.information.gov.bn/Brunei%20Today%20PDF%20Library/2014/BD%20MEI.pdf [date of access: 08/04/2019]
- Fadley Faisal. (July 29, 2017). Rape Laws Tightened. Retrieved from https://borneobulletin.com.bn/rape-laws-tightened/ [date of access: 28/01/2019]
- Rachel Thien. (n.d). Do Not Be a Silent Witness to Incestuous Rape. Retrieved from http://3g.modasys.net/index.php/news-events/around-brunei/local-news/20635-do-not-be-a-silent-witness-to-incestuous-rape.html Courtesy of the Brunei Times. [date of access: 31/10/2017]
- Rokiah Mahmud. Next Phase of Syariah Penal Code Underway. Retrieved from https://borneobulletin.com.bn/next-phase-of-syariah-penal-code-underway/ [date of access: 08/04/2019]
- Rozan Yunos. (n.d). The Mysterious Grave in the City Centre The Tale of Kubur Dang Ayang.

 Retrieved from http://www.bruneiresources.com/goldenlegacy/tgl_dang_ayang.html [date of access: 24/02/2019]

Interviews:

Ustazah Nooraida binti Haji Timpus. Bahagian Penyelidikan, Mahkamah Syariah. Bandar Seri Begawan. (2017, September 16).

ASP Mohammad Amerol bin Haji Metussin. Criminal Investigation Department. Bandar Seri Begawan. (2018, May 19).